

Port Noise Liaison Committee

Notes of Meeting held on 1 March 2023

Present:

David Richardson –Independent Chair.
Mary McFarlane – Carey’s Bay Association
Kathryn van Beek - West Harbour Community
Kristina Goldsmith - West Harbour Community
Board Representative
Brendon Shanks – Marshall Day Acoustics via
Teams
Rebecca McGrouther – Port Otago

Carlo Bell - Dunedin City Council
Tami Sargeant - Otago Regional Council
Joe Cecchi – Carey’s Bay Association
Steve Duder – Port Chalmers Yacht Club
Kent Chalmers - City Forest
Dave Cormack - Wenita Forest Products

Apologies:

Alan Worthington - Dunedin City Council
Kevin Winders - Port Otago
John Perry – West Harbour Community

Welcome from Independent Chair David Richardson

David Richardson opened the meeting at 5.00pm and welcomed everyone to the meeting.

David introduced himself and said that this was his first meeting as Independent Chair of the Noise Committee. He said he intends to keep meetings to a 1-hour duration where possible.

Committee members introduced themselves.

Apologies

Apologies noted above were accepted.

Conflicts of Interest

David stated that this agenda item is to allow committee members to state if they have any conflicts on interest in respect to items that might arise during the meeting. No one raised any conflicts.

Late Items for the Agenda

A cruise ship code of conduct was mentioned and will be discussed later in the meeting.

Personal

David said this item is to allow members to raise anything that might be personal to them. David congratulated Kathryn on being awarded the 2023 Burns Fellow and her travelling Scholarship to Hungary.

Notes of previous meeting (15 December 2022)

The notes recording the meeting on 15 December 2022 were accepted as read. Accepted by Kristina and seconded by Kathryn.

Actions Schedule from Previous Meeting

Actions & Progress from the December 2022 Action List were noted.

-
- Cold ironing – No update at this meeting and added to next meetings Action Schedule.
 - Marshall Day to noise test SFL Maui – This will be undertaken next time SFL Maui is in port. To date, weather and vessel scheduling have prevented this from occurring. Will occur at next suitable window. Added to next meetings Action Schedule
 - Noise measurements on property that requested acoustic treatment. – This will be discussed at the acoustic treatment section of today’s agenda.
 - Marshall Day to noise test Spirit of Auckland – Will test next “Spirit” vessel when it is in port and conditions allow. Added to next meetings Action Schedule
 - POL Electrical engineer to present findings of Sydney shore power visit to committee – Visit has not occurred yet. Item to remain on action list.
 - POL to have online complaints form on website – Website refresh has been drafted up to include complaints form and other noise related topics. It was suggested that the committee provide feedback on the content of the draft webpage. Rebecca to discuss this with Kevin.
 - 2023 noise committee dates to be set – To be discussed later in meeting
 - Investigate Arihi (tug) air horn going off at night – Contacted crew regarding this. They were aware horn had been going off by itself due to the heat and sun coming into the wheelhouse. To stop this happening, they are shutting down the air valve to the horn on the manifold as part of the shutdown procedure and leaving the AC on in the bridge to keep the temperature to 18 degrees.
 - Talk to Ravensdown about empty trucks slowing down prior to crossing railway lines when ship discharging fertiliser at Beach St – No ships have been at Beach St yet. Will advise next ship.

Correspondence

No correspondence for this meeting

Reports

Noise Complaints received since last meeting and actions taken

Rebecca talked to the noise complaints. The majority of complaints were about the “Spirit of” ships emitting low frequency noise. The intension is to get Marshall Day to noise test them when conditions are right. Rebecca (with Brendon’s assistance) presented some work led by Ports of Auckland on low frequency noise mitigation. The NZ ports CEO’s have agreed to put a ship noise specification in place for new and existing vessels in the NZ network. This specification means that all container ships entering NZ after 1 April will either have a NEPTUNES noise label score that will be entered into the NZ ship noise register or will be monitored at either Auckland, Lyttleton or Port Chalmers to obtain a noise label score. If the vessel has a positive noise label score it will continue service as normal with monitoring only occurring if a complaint is generated. If the vessel has a negative noise label score, the shipping line will be notified and agree on a timeline for mitigation. Once mitigation occurs, the ship will be monitored again. If the ship continues to have a negative noise score after this point it will be banned from all NZ ports. The same process will occur with existing ships on the NZ coast. If they have a negative score, they will have 6 months to mitigate and get a positive score or be banned from all NZ ports. The question was asked if testing at different ports gave a different noise label result. Brendon explained that the simplified NEPTUNES method that Marshall Day uses is done in close proximity to the vessel stack and can only be done at ports with quayside container cranes (like we have in Port Chalmers). This method takes away the variability in results. It was asked if this presentation could be shared with the community as it is a good initiative and shows the ports are working on the problem. Rebecca said that at this stage the proposal is in its infancy and led by Ports of Auckland who have only just been presented it to the shipping lines, and therefore Port Otago is not

in a position to share it at this stage. Brendon said that Marshall Day is preparing information on this that they hope to be able to share in the future. It was asked if the initiative would be extended to other vessel types. Rebecca said at this stage it is just for container ships but there is potential to expand it to other vessels in the further. The question was also asked what other ports around the world are doing. Brendon said that the European Ports currently use NEPTUNES as standard and that the Australian Ports are still working on having a standard. Rebecca said that the Ports Australia noise sub-committee were interested in the initiative that the NZ ports are putting in place.

The complaint about noise from the cruise ship was discussed. Rebecca said that the Cruise Manager had written to the cruise ship agents reminding them about the Otago Harbour environment and that playing loud music etc was not ideal. This led to a discussion about producing a cruise ship code of conduct for when ships are transiting the channel and are in port. It was agreed that the Otago Harbour is a unique place, and its wildlife and residents should be protected from too much intrusion both aural and visual. Rebecca said that she will discuss this with the Cruise Manager and see what they can come up with. The item will remain on the agenda going forward.

Quarterly Noise Reports

Brendon talked to the quarterly noise reports for the September - December 2022 period. He explained where the monitors are and how they work. He explained the hum of the port and talked about the spikes in the 1-day Ldn that were caused by low frequency vessels (the "Spirit of" ships in this case). He also pointed out where wind, repeated train horns, and the fire siren had affected the 1day Ldn.

Brendon talked about the bangs and crashes graphs. He said the Light Tower 4 had less events this quarter due to an issue with the monitor where the external supplier had reset the trigger level for a period, which meant the Lmax events were not being recorded. This has since been rectified. A question was asked about the Careys Bay monitor and whether it had been repaired and is now working correctly. Brendon said that it has been repaired and internally calibrated. He also said the intention is to do external calibration to double check when the hardware provider is down training POL staff on trouble shooting the monitors. Brendon said there is a monthly calibration tone that goes off in the system to detect any issues with calibration.

Acoustic Treatment Update

No acoustic treatment during this period. Brendon has contacted the owner of 16 Mount Street and is hoping to test the property next week (6-10 March) if conditions are suitable. He said he will inform the neighbours of what he is doing prior to using the loudspeaker outside of the house.

Rebecca mentioned that one of the recent complainants about the low frequency noise from the "Spirit of" had asked about acoustic treatment for their property. Rebecca told the complainant that unfortunately their property was in the commercial mixed-use zone in the 2GP and was not eligible for acoustic treatment. However, Rebecca did say she would raise this with the committee. Rebecca explained that the commercial mixed-use zone is outside of areas that are eligible for treatment under the 2GP as properties in that zone are exposed to road and other noise. Committee members said they would investigate this, and it could be a discussion item for the next meeting agenda. Rebecca cautioned that this maybe outside of the remit of the committee.

Update on Noise Standards from Marshall Day

Brendon from Marshall Day presented on NZS6809:1999 Port Noise Management and Land Use Planning. Brendon stated that the noise standards provide a noise framework but are not legislation unless they are adopted. The standards were developed by a committee that included ports and other

stakeholders. There are a suite of noise standards that port noise forms one branch of. The port noise standard was developed as previously ports were in the RMA and covered by local authority rules and these rules needed to be unified. The standard acknowledges that there are specific rules required for ports and communities to co-exist and that there are some areas are affected by noise. The standard required effective management of noise. The port noise standard consists of recommended noise metrics, noise control boundaries, recommended noise limits, and noise management that includes noise management plans for “bangs and crashes’ and the port noise liaison committee.

Brendon outlined the port noise metrics. For noise model predictions a Ldn 5day is used. This is a day-night average with a 10dB penalty for night-time. The question was asked what defines night-time. Brendon said night-time is from 10pm to 7am. He said for monitoring purposes the Ldn 5day, Leq(t), which is the energy average over time period (15 minute or 9 hour), and Lmax, which is the maximum level in a measurement period is used. Brendon showed POL noise metric graphs for one month and one day explaining how they are interpreted to form the noise control boundaries. The standard sets the recommended noise limits at any point on land at, or beyond the inner control boundary of 65dBA Ldn for day-night (long-term) with a 60dBA Leq (9 hour) for night time (short-term). Night time also has an Lmax limited of 85dBA. <45Ldn 5day is used for internal noise levels in buildings for noise sensitive activities. Brendon talked about the need to average noise metrics. This is because of the fluctuating pressure wave so averaging needs to occur. 5 days allows modelling of a busy period of port activity “the hum of the port”. He said long-term averages are in place to protect long-term health. The WHO night noise guidelines for Europe state “The Lnight is the average over all nights in one year. This reasoning applies also to the issue of long-term average. A value for an arbitrary single night will, except in extreme cases, bear no relationship to an individual’s long-term health status, whereas a sustained sufficiently high level over a long period may.” Short term measurements are susceptible to nearby noise events.

Brendon then compared the port noise standard to other noise standards. The said that the road traffic noise is measured on Leq 24 hour based on annual average traffic data. Airports use Ldn 3-month, European ports use Lden 1 year, and the WHO uses Lnight 1 year.

The port noise standard at Port Otago has had its recommendations adopted into the 2GP rules, has a mitigation scheme based on Noise Control Boundary noise levels, models the 5 busiest days of noise to create the model, monitors long and short-term noise levels, and has a noise management with a port noise committee.

The question was asked if the Port Noise Standard applies to other port areas in Dunedin or just Port Chalmers. A committee member stated that Port Chalmers port was considered a major facilities zone and had its own set of rules that adopt elements of the Port Noise Standard. The Dunedin ports that are in the industrial zone are subject to other noise rules within the 2GP.

It was asked if the committee could get a copy of Brendon’s presentation. Rebecca will send a copy out to committee members.

Annual Plan.

David introduced this item as the section where he wants members to think about what the committee wants to achieve for the year. Suggestions are welcome. The following ideas were suggested:

- Cruise ship code of conduct
- Noise mitigation budget. This is required within the mitigation plan
- Annual report to the POL board. This is required within the mitigation plan
- Manawhenua representative on committee

Further Meeting Schedule and times

David had suggested the first Wednesday of each quarter in earlier correspondence. He asked if the committee was happy with four meetings a year with the following dates: 7 June, 6 September, and 6 December (public meeting). The committee agreed that they are happy with these dates. The time of future meetings were discussed. David said 5pm was the most popular time from the poll that had been run but was happy with 5.30pm as an option. Committee agreed that 5.30pm was more suitable to allow people to get to Port Chalmers from Dunedin. David suggested that if members arrive 15 minutes prior to the meeting for tea and biscuits that would be a nice way to start.

Other Business

David stated that this item is to allow members to bring up other matters that haven't been discussed previously. Members had nothing to raise at this point

Chairs Business

David stated that this item is to allow him to raise any items that he might have.

David asked committee members to provide Rebecca with their mobile phone numbers to enable them to be contacted last minute if there was a change to the meeting or it is taken online.

David asked about the lines non-noise complaints pie graph and what they meant. Rebecca said that are part of the pie graphs that cant be removed, and that there were no non-noise complaints. David asked what vessel wake complaint would entail. Rebecca said this would likely involve an area of beach etc being engulfed from a wave off a vessel.

Next meeting, date, time, and location

Next meeting is Wednesday 7 June, 5.30pm at Port Otago unless advised otherwise.

Actions

Meeting date	Action	Responsible	Due	Update
October 2020	Possibility of cold ironing – watching brief	Kevin	Ongoing	
February 2022	Marshall Day to noise test SFL Maui	Rebecca/Brendon		Testing to be undertaken in 2023 next time SFL Maui is in port
April 2022	Noise measurements on property that requested acoustic treatment	Rebecca		Marshall Day undertook noise measurements on property on 17 May 2023
December 2022	Marshall Day to noise test Spirit of Auckland next time it is in port	Rebecca/Brendon		Will test next “Spirit” vessel when it is in port and conditions allow. Working through testing “Spirit of” vessels. One vessel tested to date
December 2022	POL Electrical engineer to present findings of Sydney shore power visit to committee	Kevin/Jon		
December 2022	POL to have online complaints form on website	Rebecca	Q2 2023	Done
December 2022	Talk to Ravensdown about empty trucks slowing down prior to crossing railway lines when ship discharging fertiliser at Beach St	Rebecca/Kevin	Q2 2023	No further action required
March 2023	Rebecca to discuss with Kevin about PNLC providing input into content of noise webpage	Rebecca/Kevin	Q2 2023	Website online
March 2023	Provide committee with information on ship noise specification procedure when it is available	Rebecca		Attached with meeting papers
March 2023	Prepare cruise ship code of conduct	Rebecca/Cruise Manager	Q2 2023	

March 2023	Committee to investigate acoustic treatment rules in Commercial – Mixed-use zone in Port Chalmers	Committee	Q2 2023	
March 2023	Provide committee with copy of Marshall Day presentation on Port Noise Standards	Rebecca	Via email ASAP	<u>Done</u>
March 2023	Committee members to provide committee with ideas that the committee might like to achieve in 2023	Committee	Q2 2023	
March 2023	Committee members to provide Rebecca with their phone numbers to enable them to be contacted last minute if meetings change etc	Committee	Email to be sent ASAP to remind members	<u>Most members have provided phone number</u>