

Port Noise Liaison Committee - Public Meeting

Notes of Meeting held on 15 December 2022,

Present:

Paul Rea - Port Otago

Kevin Winders - Port Otago

Mary McFarlane – Carey’s Bay Association

Kathryn van Beek - West Harbour Community

Kristina Goldsmith - West Harbour Community

Board Representative

Alan Worthington - Dunedin City Council

Brendon Shanks – Marshall Day Acoustics

Rebecca McGrouther – Port Otago

Carlo Bell - Dunedin City Council

Richard Saunders - Otago Regional Council

David Richardson – Incoming independent Chair.

Apologies:

Joe Cecchi – Carey’s Bay Association

Steve Duder – Port Chalmers Yacht Club

John Perry – West Harbour Community

Kent Chalmers - City Forest – via Zoom

Dave Cormack - Wenita Forest Products

5 members of the public were in attendance

Welcome

Paul Rea opened the meeting at 5.30pm and welcomed everyone to the meeting.

Paul noted that this is a regular committee meeting followed by a Q&A session from the public at the end.

Paul said that the last public meeting was held in 2019 (due to covid), and that the agenda at that meeting was wider then. The forum is now only for port noise with general community environment items picked up by the West Harbour Community Board.

Paul stated that this is his last meeting of the Port Noise Liaison Committee as he has stepped down as a Port Otago Board Member. He said he has been chairing the committee meetings since 2011. He thanked the committee for the input over the years.

Paul introduced David Richardson who is the new Independent Chair of the Committee. The Independent Chair role is a requirement of the 2GP, which is now operative for the port. David introduced himself to the group. David would like to meet with all committee members individually.

Apologies

Apologies noted above were accepted.

Notes of previous meetings

The notes recording the meeting on 6 September 2022 were accepted.

Actions Completed

Paul went through the September 2022 Action List and explained the following actions:

- Cold ironing – Update will be provided as part of today’s agenda.

-
- Marshall Day to noise test SFL Maui – This will be undertaken next time SFL Maui is in port. This could be next week depending on when the vessel arrives pre-Christmas. Otherwise, it will occur in 2023
 - Noise measurements on property that requested acoustic treatment. – This will be discussed at the acoustic treatment section of today’s agenda.

Noise Reporting – Presentation from Marshall Day

Brendon from Marshall Day introduced himself to the group. He also introduced his presentation and stated that it would outline the following: Marshall Day’s role with the port, the 2GP update, the quarterly noise monitoring summary, the 2022 noise model update, and ship noise.

Brendon stated that Marshall Day’s role included the following: assess monitoring data, engage with Noise Liaison Committee, predict port noise levels in the community, and assist in noise mitigation and management

He went on to talk about the low frequency noise from the Rio Class vessels and the mitigation that was put in place to silence the vessels. He explained the difference between low and high frequency noise that experienced from inside a house. Brendon also said that Marshall Day had won the AAAC (Association of Australasian Acoustical Consultants) Hugh Viviane Taylor Award for 2022, which is the top Australasian Acoustics industry award for their work with silencing the Rio’s.

Brendon gave an update on the changes to port noise with the port portion of the 2GP now operative. He said there is very little change from previous district plan rule. Updates from Marshall Day’s perspective are:

- Management - Update management plan to include new rule and add process for addressing noisy vessels
- Mitigation – E.g. work to mitigate low frequency noise from Rios
- Liaison Committee – Reporting and engagement (presenting quarterly reports and answering questions)
- Measurement – Greater detail on the type of monitoring. Updated to reflect improving technology

Brendon presented the September 2022 quarterly report. He outlined what is in the quarterly report and how it is read. Brendon explained the ‘Hum of the Port’ and how it shows the 1 day and 5-day LDN’s. These are analysed to determine what creates the noise levels.

He talked about the ‘bangs and crashes’. He outlined that the noise monitors pick up all noise, not just port noise, and explained how the audio recordings work. He also explained how the machine learning software works to categorise noise events into different bins. Paul said that the machine learning software had won the developer a Microsoft award when it was first developed.

Brendon talked about the 2022 noise model for the port. The model update is an annual requirement and includes all the noise from the monitors for the year. The 2022 contour update states the following: that there is no change to Port Operation, still includes Rio visit (without silencer) as a worse case noise scenario, shows some buildings removed which has resulted in some noise “hot spots”, and the model is currently over predicting towards Cemetery Monitor. The current POL office building is expected to be removed in 2023. Marshall Day will use 2023 to undertake a detailed revision of the model next year.

Brendon said that in 2023 Marshall Day expects to undertake the following work for the port: incorporate 2GP provision into Port Noise Management Plan, a detailed update of port noise model, continue to refine the automatic identification and reporting system for high noise events (e.g. bangs and crashes), and support further discussion with shipping lines on appropriate ship noise levels.

The floor was opened for questions on Brendon's presentation.

A question was asked about tug Arihi's air horn going off at different times of the day and night, and why this was occurring? It has been reported to Harbour Control several times.

Port representatives were not aware of this but would look into the matter and provide an update.

The question was asked if Brendon believed the Port Noise Standards were still relevant given they are 20+ years old?

Brendon said that in addition to Ldn, Marshall Day also use the Lmax (bangs and crashes) data to assist with assessing the effect of port noise. He also said that assessing bangs and crashes is a requirement of the 2GP for the port. Brendon said that in his view the standards are still fit for purpose.

A comment was raised about the fertiliser ships working at Beach St and the empty trucks making a loud noise when they crossed the railway lines into the port.

POL said that they will put in a new requirement for these trucks to slow down when crossing the lines to try and mitigate the noise. POL also stated that there shouldn't be too many more fertiliser ship discharges in Port Chalmers going forward.

Complaints Update

Complaints were taken as read.

The complaint in September about the Spirit of Auckland was discussed. It has been in port the last few days (12-15 December), and it had noisier than usual. Brendon is going to see if Marshall Day has tested before and test it next time it is in port.

Acoustic Treatment

No acoustic treatment during this period. However, POL and Marshall Day have spoken with the homeowner at 16 Mount St about undertaking acoustic testing either prior to or after Christmas. Brendon explained the new method for testing properties that involves a loud speaker outside the house and measuring the noise inside the house. This method means that testing is no longer reliant on a noisy ship day in port. It was suggested by the committee that a localised letterbox drop is undertaken to inform neighbours about noise from the loud speaker.

Cold Ironing

Kevin provided an update on cold ironing. He said that POL has an electrical engineer who has been tasked with looking at what is going on in the cold ironing space in Australia. A port in Sydney is installing shore power for 5 ships at the cost of between \$60m-\$100m AUD that is paid for by the federal government. POL electrical engineer will report back to the committee after visiting Sydney.

Cruise ships have used the covid break to retrofit ships with shore power. Approximately 50% of cruise ships are now fitted with plugs for shore power. Approximate cost per ship is \$1.3m USD.

POL has engaged with Aurora to investigate if it is possible to have shore power in Port Chalmers. The current substation has 9 megawatt capacity, of which POL uses approximately 80%. Cold ironing would require another substation and line upgrade that would cost approximately \$100m. For cold ironing to be viable, all New Zealand ports would need to engage. POL is working with Ports of Auckland on this.

Q&A Session

Comment about noise from cruise ship PA and passenger TV's can be heard onshore. Forgot about making a complaint about it but suggested having an online form on the website for people to use or adding "complaints" to the general enquiries phone number on the POL website.

POL will look into making an online complaint form and adding “complaints” to general enquires phone number on POL website.

Question asked where trucks will enter and exit terminal when the current office is demolished?

Kevin said that there are currently two options under review, and it will depend on where the rail pad is situated. Changing of the truck entrance and exit will likely occur in September 2023.

Question was asked about how many people present are on facebook and if they use the Port Otago facebook page?

POL to look at options for boosting the facebook page and sharing more posts to the Port Chalmers Community page. Also look into options about having a facebook feed on the main POL website.

The question was asked about other community environment projects and how they are now dealt with?

Kevin said that the DCC, ORC, Iwi and POL are working together to come up with a harbour amenity plan for Otago Harbour.

David on behalf of the committee thanked Paul for his time on the committee.

The meeting closed at 7.00pm

Next meeting: 2023 dates to be confirmed and sent to committee

Actions

Meeting date	Action	Responsible	Due	Update
October 2020	Possibility of cold ironing – watching brief	Kevin	Ongoing	
February 2022	Marshall Day to noise test SFL Maui	Rebecca/Brendon		Testing to be undertaken in 2023 next time SFL Maui is in port
April 2022	Second representative for West Harbour Community. West Harbour Community Board representative to follow up	West Harbour Community Board rep		
April 2022	Noise measurements on property that requested acoustic treatment	Rebecca		Marshall Day to undertake acoustic treatment measurements going forward
December 2022	Marshall Day to noise test Spirit of Auckland next time it is in port	Rebecca/Brendon		Will test next “Spirit” vessel when it is in port and conditions allow
December 2022	POL Electrical engineer to present findings of Sydney shore power visit to committee	Kevin/Jon		
December 2022	POL to have online complaints form on website	Rebecca	Q1 2023	Refresh of POL noise website currently underway. Will include an online complaints form
December 2022	2023 noise committee dates to be set	Kevin/David/Rebecca	Q1 2023	To be discussed further at meeting.
December 2022	Investigate Arihi air horn issues	Rebecca	Q1 2023	Contacted crew regarding this. Their response is as follows: The horn has been going off by itself due to the heat and sun coming into the wheel house.

To stop this happening, we are now shutting of the air valve to the horn on the manifold as part of the shutdown procedure and leaving the AC on the bridge on cool around 18 degrees.

December 2022	Talk to Ravensdown about empty trucks slowing down prior to crossing railway lines when ship discharging fertiliser at Beach St	Rebecca/Kevin	Q1 2023
---------------	---	---------------	---------